Governor’s Poverty Reduction Work Group – 9/20/18 Minutes

Welcome
Members heard opening remarks by co-leads David Stillman, Diane Klontz. As well as a welcome from Lin Zhou, President, Bates Technical College.

Open since 1940, Bates has provided accessible affordable and quality educational programs that lead students to careers, and employers to well-trained employees. With three Tacoma locations, Bates offers a wide diversity of educational opportunities for everyone, from certificates, certifications, Associate in Applied Science, and Associate in Applied Science transfer degrees, to adult education, lifelong learning, and high school completion options.

Take Away of Opening Exercise
Members were asked: What is the one thing that you have learned in our last eight months together that has changed the way you think about this work?

1. Group Learning Process, everyone is learning the complexity of the problem
2. Many felt the conversation is mainstream for the first time in their working careers
3. Poverty reduction work is based 100% in inequity. The work will be bold around race and equity perspective but we will not succeed if we don’t appreciate that.
4. Systemic change has a high priority. For some, this is the first time talking about systemic change and that is grounding and exciting. Some have been wondering how best to communicate change in the system in Washington state and this work is trying to address those institutional systems that were put in place historically, it is necessary and bold to look at these systems differently.
5. While we have a lot of great solutions to helping people, they are one-off’s and we need to build on the system. This work cannot be about changing current programs to help people get ahead. For example, moving up into higher earnings is not an individual effort but a community and family effort. And having employers engaged helps design ways for employers to stay connected and sustain work longer.
6. What we say and how we frame this work is critical.
7. Grateful for the Governor elevating this issue.
8. No work can be done alone in a vacuum, there is a great importance of continuing to learn and building of partnerships. Continue to approach this work helps broaden perspective, build on one another’s thinking, and establish allies that we never really knew existed.
9. This is a long term effort, change happens two directionally – top down and bottom up.

Finalizing the Progress Report to the Governor
In the weeks leading up to this meeting the members were sent a draft of the progress report and asked to provide confidential feedback via the following survey.
| Q1 | Read the Introduction on pages 3-5 and then answer the questions below. | Do you like the introduction? Start Over Meh Neutral Nice Work Nailed It | Do you have specific comments, edits, or recommendations for the introduction? Please reference page numbers and charts when providing specific feedback. |
| Q2 | Read The Case for Reducing Poverty & Inequality on pages 6-14 and answer the following questions. | Do you like this section? Start Over Meh Neutral Nice Work Nailed It | Do you have specific comments, edits, or recommendations for this section? Please reference page numbers and charts when providing specific feedback. |
| Q3 | Read In Their Own Words on pages 7-18. These stories were collected from PRWG members, as well as people that have served on panels during our meetings. They have been edited for length and anonymity. Please answer the following questions. | Do you like this section? Start Over Meh Neutral Nice Work Nailed It | Do you have specific comments, edits, or recommendations for this section? Please reference page numbers and charts when providing specific feedback. |
| Q4 | Read Opportunities for Change on pages 19-24 and answer the following questions. | Do you like this section? Start Over Meh Neutral Nice Work Nailed It | Do you have specific comments, edits, or recommendations for this section? Please reference page numbers and charts when providing specific feedback. |
| Q5 | The “root causes” diagram on page 20 and “strategies framework on page 22 have been modified based on feedback from the last meeting in Tacoma. They are intended to represent the collective thinking of PRWG thus far, but indicate we remain a work-in progress. The “Examples” part of the framework is intended to show targeted strategies for the people most affected by poverty. More detailed narrative explaining the framework, as well as the root causes diagram above it, will be added to the report following your feedback. | Do you like the root cause diagram? Start Over Meh Neutral Nice Work Nailed It | Do you like the strategies framework? Start Over Meh Neutral Nice Work Nailed It |
| Q6 | Read Next Steps & Mid-Course Recommendations on page 25. These will be discussed in detail at our 9/20 meeting and are placeholders right now. Please provide additional recommendations that you would like to be considered at this point in time. | Do you have specific comments, edits or recommendations on the root cause diagram or strategies framework? Please reference page numbers and charts when providing specific feedback. |
| Q7 | The following questions are to get a sense of how you feel about the report in general. Do you like the overall structure, tone, and content of report? Is there anything you especially like about the report? Is there anything you feel strongly about changing? | |
| Q8 | Any other feedback you would like to make at this time? | |
General Takeaway from Survey and Discussion
There was a lot of feedback on wordsmithing. This is understandable as everyone is coming at this from a different angel. Drafters pledged to do their best to take that feedback and strike a tone that doesn’t take away from the integrity of the report.

The report needs better consensus around the Graphs, Charts, and Data.

Striking a balance on tone is tricky. The report needs to honor the work around understanding, inequity, racism, and historical trauma that this group has done. And demonstrate that the group needs a lot more work and conversation around these issues. But at the same time, the tone should reflect mindfulness that not everyone is at the same level of knowledge about these issues. We want to balance the conversation regarding equity and disparity in a way that isn’t “blaming” but rather elevating the stories.

The mid-course recommendations were new to people and they wanted to learn more.

A hand full of folks provided feedback to start over or questioned their continued participation in the group. This was the minority of comments but should not be ignored.

The Group followed with a discussion on what they need to see in the report to move the average from “nice work” to “nailed it”

Take Away from moving average from “nice work” to “nailed it”
- Who has not been at the table? Employers, people who are deeply marginalized.
- Include disabilities and less focus on employment pathways because not everybody can work.
- Report is dense an difficult to chew on
- More work around illiteracy
- Report tells a great story of where we started and where we are going
- Highlight in the executive summary that this is systemic
- Providing opportunity to get out of poverty without compromise
- What we have is not working and we need to make broad systemic changes
- Healthcare and ensuring health is a root cause that may cause or mitigate poverty and help those stay on the path to getting out of poverty.
- The progress report included some recommendations that the group discussed. Specifically the criteria used for inclusion of each recommendation and the role of PRWG in supporting these.

**Part 2 - Afternoon**
The groups broke out for table discussions. The criteria was:

- List 3 to 5 items:
  - What should be the main priorities for the report?
  - What is most essential to communicate right now?

**Written results from each table’s discussion**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority</th>
<th>Written results from each table’s discussion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Washita systems of communication and alignment (beyond just aligning with the governor) 2. Too much data/statistics leads to not enough focus on priorities 3. Clearly articulate the diversity of opinion within the group</td>
<td>1. Intent going forward – milestones, long range communication 2. Framework for decisions – racial equity baked in, accountability, impact 3. Testing bold innovative solutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Give Gov. comprehensive update – Communicate – justify existence 2. Provide avenue to Gov for he and his staff of weaving poverty reduction into considered legislation for 2019 session 3. Don’t miss opportunity and need for importance of weaving the public and private work that can connect employment for continued success – bridge social services with employment that is both advocate and employer focused</td>
<td>1. Credibility of report – unbiased data appears included and narrative does as well 2. Emphasize self-determination incentives and support efforts to transition into viable employment 3. Criminal justice systems transitioning of inmates back into communities with job &amp; education skills enhancement 4. Emanate counter effective program support issues - “cliff effect” of support ending early</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach Strategy Economic Development Committees Labor Committees Budget Committees (investment) Add – Recommendations page 25 Acknowledge Initial ideas work will be done to develop moving forward. Short term – 2019 session – look at agenda items from other groups that support our goals.</td>
<td>Add more examples of what we’re considering (Maybe on page 22) These are systemic issues that will require big, systemic solutions Let’s get the framework right – we’re close! p. 25 Recs – need to regroup, provide context and specific recommendations/actions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Very High Level narrative of  
| - “Black & White” data combined with stories  
| - Because – we want for the Gov and staff to be on board for BIG systemic change | 1. Credibility – like banking, business round table champion  
2. Emphasize debts/regulation connect & disconnect – data system  
3. Incentives for businesses to meet employee needs, create how  
4. Emphasize community self-determinant |
| For executive summary up front put the truth up front  
Accept gaps up front  
Be honest  
Don’t all agree  
Missing voices – disabilities, seniors, refugees, offenders, vets, rural, urban, faith  
What is long turn accountability?  
Focus groups/listening sessions  
Important parts  
Investments  
- Root causes  
- Guiding principles  
- Put executive summary up front and/or lit guide pull out  
- Info graphic  
Mid-course recommendations  
+ Mini steps?  
i.e. 3 – Auto enrollment, kids in college board  
7 – Fund working families tax credit. | Page 25 *Outreach Plan  
- What groups  
- What do we want to know  
- Feedback mechanism  
Seniors, dd, vets, business  
*Add why are people poor?  
-- strengthening links  
-- plain speak  
*Intermix stories into the data to bolster assertions  
*Executive Summary/Talking Points/Top Line Message  
*Strategy for engagement of our sphere of influence |
| 1. include office insurance commissioner policy options with mid-course recommendations to the governor for action in 2019  
2. add a section on community self-determination so those historically in poverty can identify how best to move the bar on poverty |

Meeting closed with understanding that another draft would go out to PRWG for feedback then turned into the Governor at the beginning of October.